MEETING THE NEEDS OF OUR MULTILINGUAL [EL] STUDENTS

Research-based Policies and Practice
Overview

- Demographics
- Problem
- Board of Education Cultural & Linguistic Policies
  - Seal of Biliteracy (105.15)
  - Multilingualism for Equitable Education (105.14)
- Recommendations
  - Strengthen DOE EL services
  - Implement Linguistic Policies
  - Connecting to ESSA
The majority of the world is Multilingual.
Hawaii’s Multicultural students
Multilingualism all around
### Table 204.20. Number and percentage of public school students participating in programs for English language learners, by state: Selected years, 2002-03 through 2011-12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Number of public school students participating in programs for English language learners</th>
<th>Percent of students participating in programs for English language learners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>4,118,918</td>
<td>4,421,489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>10,568</td>
<td>16,550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td>16,351</td>
<td>20,743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td>140,664</td>
<td>166,195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td>15,146</td>
<td>20,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>1,587,771</td>
<td>1,557,935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>86,118</td>
<td>99,790</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>21,970</td>
<td>28,662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delaware</td>
<td>3,445</td>
<td>5,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District of Columbia</td>
<td>5,363</td>
<td>4,274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>203,659</td>
<td>221,624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>12,853</td>
<td>18,160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>168,591</td>
<td>172,375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td>42,560</td>
<td>56,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td>13,961</td>
<td>15,156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas</td>
<td>17,942</td>
<td>24,671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>6,343</td>
<td>10,138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisiana</td>
<td>11,042</td>
<td>11,942</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maine</td>
<td>2,575</td>
<td>3,332</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Home Language of English Language Learner Students Enrolled in May 2014
The Ten Most Prevalent Languages are Represented on the Map

- Ilokano: 2,695
- English: 1,773
- Chuukese: 1,741
- Marshallese: 1,505
- Tagalog: 1,049
- Spanish: 745
- Samoan: 505
- Japanese: 456
- Mandarin: 389
- Vietnamese: 265
- Tongan: 248
- Cantonese: 248
- Pohnpeian: 247
- Kosraean: 216
- Other: 188
- Cebuano: 177
- Korean: 175
- Thai: 71
- Hawaiian: 69
- Lao: 55
- Arabic: 29
- Russian: 29
- French: 27
- Portuguese: 23
- Pangasinan: 19
- German: 15
- Yapese: 12
- Pampango: 10

Total: 13027
3950/13027 Filipino languages makes up 30% of languages spoken in DOE

3753/13027 Micronesian languages make up 29%
Top 12 DOE Most Used Languages

Most Used Languages with 200+ Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Most Used Language</th>
<th>#</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ilokano</td>
<td>2920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chuukese</td>
<td>1640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marshallese</td>
<td>1583</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tagalog</td>
<td>1370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>867</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoan</td>
<td>517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandarin</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnamese</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korean</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tongan</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cantonese</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source, 2011 ELL “Most Used” Languages.
(Note, approximately 33% of ELLs, indicate English is their most used language)
Academic Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All Students</th>
<th>English Learners (includes recently exited students)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Students (K-12)</strong></td>
<td>180,895</td>
<td><strong>13,501</strong> (7% of all students) (5 yr. avg= 10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>English Proficiency</strong></td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Math Proficiency</strong></td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Graduation Rate</strong></td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hawaii’s Multilingual/English Learners are far less likely than their native English-speaking peers to be proficient in English Language Arts and Mathematics, and to graduate.
Performance differences among “High Needs” subgroups

Performance differential among low income, special education, English Language Learners: Percent of students met achievement standard, Smarter Balanced 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ELA/Literacy</th>
<th>Math</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Needs (All High Needs Subgroups)</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economically Disadvantaged</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Education</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Language Learner</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2013 HSA Achievement by Race/Ethnicity
Seven largest race/ethnicities in order of population size.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Math</th>
<th>Reading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filipino</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoan</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micronesian</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Median Student Growth Percentiles by Ethnicity and Subject

- Native Hawaiian
- Filipino
- White
- Japanese
- Hispanic
- Samoan
- Micronesian
Stages of Multilingualism Policy Development

2014
Listening

• With feedback from focused stakeholder meetings and community input, the desire was to develop a language in education policy that viewed student linguistic and cultural diversity as assets in order to promote equity.

2014-2015
Learning

• To develop language in education policy evidenced in theory and research, several stakeholders, including national leading experts in policy, planning and multilingualism, provided feedback and guidance.

2015-2016
Policy Formulation

• To develop the language in education policy, BOE Stakeholder Committees were formed, which consisted of community and school representatives, who facilitated policy formation, and then incorporated feedback and revisions from multiple stakeholders.
Benefits of Multilingualism

**LINGUISTIC**
Better awareness and perception of language

**ACADEMIC**
Wider vocab & success in college entrance exams

**COGNITIVE**
Better problem solving and critical thinking skills

**SOCIAL**
Appreciation of own and other cultures and languages
Integration of home language results in gains in academic outcomes on par with or surpassing outcomes in English-only programs.

(Fu, 2009; Genesee & Lindholm-Leary, 2014)

Children learning to read in a second language use their first language to facilitate their acquisition of reading skills in the second language.

(August & Shanahan, 2006); (Goldenberg, 2008).

Dual-language models, including heritage language programs, enhance student outcomes and have been shown to close the achievement gap.

(Collier & Thomas, 2014)
Policy Journey

EL → ML → EL/ML → ML

EL
Hawaiian/Indigenous All Learners
Hawaiian Education
(BOE Policy 105.7)
Ka Papahana Kaiapuni
(BOE Policy 105.8)

Heritage/ World Language Learners
Seal of Biliteracy
(BOE Policy 105.15)

Multilingual/ EL & Immigrant Learners
Multilingualism for Equitable Education
(BOE Policy 105.14)

Family & Community Engagement/ Partnership
“Embracing the diverse cultures, languages, strengths and needs of all families”
(BOE 101.14)
NAʻHOPENA AʻO (HA) (BOE POLICY E-3)

Hawaiian/Indigenous All Learners
Hawaiian Education
(BOE Policy 105.7)
Ka Papahana Kaiapuni
(BOE Policy 105.8)

Heritage/ World Language Learners
Seal of Biliteracy
(BOE Policy 105.15)

Multilingual/ EL & Immigrant Learners
Multilingualism for Equitable Education
(BOE Policy 105.14)

Students & Families

Family & Community Engagement/ Partnership
“Embracing the diverse cultures, languages, strengths and needs of all families”
(BOE 101.14)
Multilingual/EL & Immigrant Learners
Multilingualism for Equitable Education
(BOE Policy 105.14)

Students & Families

Heritage/ World Language Learners
Seal of Biliteracy
(BOE Policy 105.15)
“The Board of Education hereby establishes a Seal of Biliteracy to be awarded upon graduation to students who demonstrate a high proficiency in either of the State’s two official languages and at least one additional language, including American Sign Language.”
Seal of Biliteracy
(BOE Policy 105.15)

- Speaking or Signing
- Reading Writing
- English or Hawaiian and an additional language
- High Level of Proficiency
RATIONALE:
“The Board of Education recognizes that there is personal, cultural, social, academic, and vocational/occupational value in encouraging students to maintain, or develop, proficiency in more than one language.”
Multilingual/ EL & Immigrant Learners
Multilingualism for Equitable Education *(BOE Policy 105.14)*

Students & Families

Heritage/ World Language Learners
Seal of Biliteracy *(BOE Policy 105.15)*
Multilingualism for Equitable Education (BOE Policy 105.14)

“Multilingualism is the act of using or promoting the use of multiple languages by an individual speaker or a community of speakers”
K-12 Vision

All cultures and languages are valuable resources to learn and live in Hawaiʻi and our global community. Multilingualism creates learning environments that draw from the rich linguistic diversity and cultural strengths of Hawaii’s students.

The Board of Education recognizes the important role of multilingualism in providing a meaningful and equitable education for student achievement.
Vision

All cultures and languages are valuable resources to learn and live in Hawai‘i and our global community. Multilingualism creates learning environments that draw from the rich linguistic diversity and cultural strengths of Hawaii’s students.

The Board of Education recognizes the important role of multilingualism in providing a meaningful and equitable education for student achievement.

“I feel my child is safe in school when his cultural identity is honored and validated.”
~ Chuukese Parent
Vision

All cultures and languages are valuable resources to learn and live in Hawai‘i and our global community. Multilingualism creates learning environments that draw from the rich linguistic diversity and cultural strengths of Hawaii’s students.

The Board of Education recognizes the important role of multilingualism in providing a meaningful and equitable education for student achievement.

“I feel my child is safe in school when his cultural identity is honored and validated.”
~ Chuukese Parent

“Equality means everyone gets exactly the same; Equity means everyone gets what they need.”
Rationale

Research shows when students’ identities, histories, cultures, and languages are included in a meaningful and equitable education, they are better able to learn academic content and the official language medium of education.
Goals

1. To provide a range of language education program(s) for multilingual students, which includes EL students and students who want to learn an additional language.

2. To provide effective educators with appropriate knowledge, skills, and instructional materials.

3. To provide outreach supports to families to become actively engaged in their children’s education.
Goal 1: Range of Language Programs

- **According to Federal Law**, language services or programs for EL students must be “educationally sound and adequately supported with effective staff and resources.”
- Hawaiʻi examples: ESL, heritage language, and Hawaiian dual language immersion, American Sign Language
- Desire is to provide more opportunities for a range of language programs
Range of Language Programs

Monolingual

Submersion (Sink or swim) → ESL → World/Heritage Language Programs → Bilingual Education

Multilingual
Goal 2: Effective Educators

- According to Federal Law, schools must provide English learners with language programs led by qualified teachers.
Effective Educators

**General Educator (English Medium Classroom)**
- Recognizes linguistics assets children bring to class
- Integrates language instruction (i.e. scaffolding and differentiation) into all content areas
- Allows children to use their languages as a tool to learn (i.e. translanguaging)

**Language Specialist**
- Background in Bilingual Education, Second Language Acquisition & Sociolinguistics
- Specialized curriculum & assessment
- Targeted English language instruction and support
Goal 3: Provide Outreach Supports for Families

• According to Federal Law, parents must have access to meaningful communication in a language they can understand

• Hawaii example: Bilingual School Home Assistance (BSHA) program

“ELL students benefit from a statewide culture encouraging clear parent communication and engagement.” ~ Education Commission of States
Policy Support & Accountability

- Multilingual Advisory Council
- Annual BOE Report
- Pursue State Funding
DOE Policies Implementation

- Roll out 2016-2017
- Seal logo contest
- Offer existing language assessments (AP, IB, Avante online testing)
- Develop additional language tests

- Working Group
- Advisory Council
- Implementation Plan
- Pilot study, teacher education, professional development
Recommendations

• Increase Resources
• Increase Organizational Support and Staffing
• Focus on Teacher Quality (Pre-service and In-Service)
Increase Resources

- Increase General Funds - $10 Million WSF for EL Students
- Expand Bilingual School Home Assistance Programs
- Hire Translators & Interpreters
- Offer Newcomer Centers
- Explore categorical funding for bilingual education pilot programs
Organizational Support & Staffing

- “Maintain and develop English language learner/Title 3 group for stronger support to schools and our students”

- OCISS Reorganization Presentation
  (BOE Human Resources Committee, May 2016)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School Year</th>
<th>OCISS Staffing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006-2007</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-2013</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Art/World Language Specialist
22 staff
22 staff

ELL “Group” 3 Staff

22 staff
Recommendations

• Separate Art/ World Language to own specialists
• Increase ELL Staff at OCISS
• Elevate “Group” to “Section”
• Consider renaming Section (i.e. Office of English Learner and Multilingual Achievement)
Quality Teachers

- Develop Monitoring System
- Replace 6 & 12 professional development “credit” to meet EL teacher requirements with Licensure Program
- Partner with Teacher Education programs
  - Recruit more World Language teachers
  - Expand EL Elementary & Secondary programs to license teachers with HTSB K-12 TESOL License
- Recruit and train part-time assistants, bilingual teachers
- Pursue scholarships and financial support for diverse and multilingual community members to become teachers
BOE/ DOE Strategic & ESSA Plan

• The new strategic plan and the state plan for the federal ESSA will work hand-in-hand to:

1. Support our youth so they can achieve their goals;
2. Support innovation; and
3. Support a positive path forward that builds on growth and lessons learned.
Our Mission
We serve our community by developing the academic achievement, character, and social-emotional well-being of our students to the fullest potential. We work with partners, families, and communities to ensure that all students reach their aspirations from early learning through college, career, and citizenship.

Our Vision
Hawai‘i’s students are educated, healthy, and joyful lifelong learners who contribute positively to our community and global society.

Our Core Values
Hawai‘i seeks for its students to meet and exceed world-class academic standards, and do so in a way that reflects our island perspective. Hawai‘i’s students have strengths and abilities unique to an island home, with a tradition of stewardship, community, and mutual responsibility. We will cultivate, advance, and draw from Hawai‘i’s rich traditions and Native Hawaiian host culture.

1. COMMITMENT TO EQUITY & EXCELLENCE: We believe every child is unique and deserves an excellent education—one that develops the whole student. Students succeed when their specific needs are met and their potential is realized.

2. MEANINGFUL LEARNING: We learn from many sources and in many ways. Hawai‘i provides abundant real-world learning environments relevant for success in a culturally diverse, technologically complex, and interdependent global society.

3. CARING RELATIONSHIPS: Education is a responsibility shared by all and the best results come when we work together with aloha, respect, integrity, and openness.

4. CONNECTION TO COMMUNITY, FAMILY, AND ‘ĀÏNA: We see students as part of an extended ‘ohana, the environment, a larger community and a global society. Hawai‘i students value these connections and become stewards to help make our world a better place.

Our Beliefs
This 2012 Strategic Plan Update is built upon what we know are the keys to ensuring that all students can reach their fullest potential and attain their aspirations in the 21st century:

- Students do better when they come to school ready to learn, from the first day of kindergarten to the last day of senior year. Parents, caregivers, extended ‘ohana, and community can provide crucial support and guidance to help students focus on and enhance their learning.
Our Mission
We serve our community by developing the academic achievement, character, and social-emotional well-being of our students to the fullest potential. We work with partners, families, and communities to ensure that all students reach their aspirations from early learning through college, career, and citizenship.

Our Vision
Hawaii’s students are educated, healthy, and joyful lifelong learners who contribute positively to our community and

Our Core Values
Hawaii seeks for its students to meet and exceed world-class academic standards, and do so in a way that reflects our island perspective. Hawaii’s students have strengths and abilities unique to an island home, with a tradition of stewardship, community, and mutual responsibility. We will cultivate, advance, and draw from Hawaii’s rich traditions and Native Hawaiian host culture.

believe every child is unique and deserves an excellent education—one that develops the whole student. Students succeed when their specific needs are met and

2. MEANINGFUL LEARNING: We learn from many sources and in many ways. Hawaii provides abundant real-world learning environments relevant for success in a culturally diverse, technologically complex, and interdependent global society.

3. CARING RELATIONSHIPS: Education is a responsibility shared by all and the best results come when we work together with aloha, respect, integrity, and openness.

4. CONNECTION TO COMMUNITY, FAMILY, AND AINA: We see students as part of an extended ohana, the environment, a larger community and a global society. Hawaii’s students value these connections and become stewards to help make our world a better place.

Our Beliefs
This 2012 Strategic Plan Update is built upon what we know are the keys to ensuring that all students can reach their fullest potential and attain their aspirations in the 21st century:

- Students do better when they come to school ready to learn, from the first day of kindergarten to the last day of senior year. Parents, caregivers, extended ohana, and community can provide crucial support and guidance to help students focus on and enhance their learning.
Recommendations

• Integrate Cultural and Linguistic Policies into BOE-DOE Strategic Plan
ESSA continues NCLB’s focus on equity: college and career readiness, equitable access to effective educators and funding directed to low-income children.

Our focus in this document is on using these five areas of ESSA to advance state goals to increase equity of opportunity and achievement for low-income children and children of color.
ESSA flexibility on accountability and school improvement:

- Maintain focus on high needs students
- Maintain weight in accountability matrix for EL students
- Lower $N =$ size to monitor EL student achievement
- Provide variety of assessment types, which benefits Multilingual [EL] learners
ESSA drives equity, preparation and leadership

• Report data on teacher qualifications across income groups and ethnicities
  • OHR should monitor EL teacher qualifications
  • OCISS should mandate EL Licensure
• Use Title 2 funds for new Teacher academies for schools serving high-need students
  • focus on language development professional development
Concluding Thoughts

To make the most of ESSA, we recommend defining or re-asserting your state’s “North Star” vision and priorities as a first step.

- **Avoid the compliance mentality.** Lead from your big vision for improving teaching and learning—make that your **North Star**—rather than starting with what ESSA requires or allows.

- **Don’t innovate for innovation’s sake;** take advantage of new flexibilities only when they help your state make progress against your vision.

- **Keep the focus on decisions that improve students’ lives,** not those that make the work of adults easier.

- **Engage stakeholders meaningfully,** but *don’t try to get everyone to agree on everything.*

---

The guidance we provide in *Making the Most of ESSA* can help you take the reins and drive forward your own state vision.